

MINUTES OF MEETING
TOWN OF WHEATLAND BOARD OF ASSESSMENT REVIEW
May 22, 2012

Members present: Gary Hults, Lisa Wasson, and W. Smith O'Brien

Members absent: Joseph Dispenza, and Janet Rancour

Also present: Mark Schnorr, Assessor

The Town of Wheatland Assessment Review Board met on Tuesday, May 22, 2012 at the Wheatland Municipal Building, Scottsville, New York to review and make decisions on grievance forms filed for 2012. Mr. Mark Schnorr was available for any questions that the Board had in regard to the complaints. Mr. Gary Hults as chairman called the meeting to order.

The following grievances were presented to the board:

- | | |
|---|--|
| 1) Edward Everts
2 Genesee Street
Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 200.06-1-44
Property Address: 2 Genesee Street
Assessed: \$88,600.00
Requested: \$81,100.00 |
|---|--|

Mr. Everts reported that his assessment went up based on adding a room to his house. He said that this is a storage room only, that it is not heated, and has not increased his living space. He brought in a list of comparisons

W. Smith O'Brien made a motion to reduce the assessment to \$84,000.00 based on supporting documentation, and the comparison list, seconded by Gary Hults and unanimously passed.

- | | |
|--|--|
| 2) Jamie Swann
30 Scott Crescent
Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 200.06-2-32
Property Address: 14 Oakwood Lane
Assessed: \$100,000.00
Requested: \$70,000.00 |
|--|--|

Mr. Swann bought the house in 2008 for 70,000.00 and he stated that at this time it is unlivable. It only has framework on the inside, no walls, plumbing, or insulation. The roof leaks and he said that he is having trouble keeping the wildlife out of the house. He put new siding on the outside, put in a new furnace, new windows and A/C. He stated that the increase in taxes would make it hard for him to complete the work that he needs to do, and make a profit when selling the house.

Gary Hults made a motion to uphold the Assessor based on the lack of evidence. Seconded by W. Smith O'Brien and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|---|--|
| 3) | Jamie Swann
30 Scott Crescent
Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 200.09-2-21
Property Address: 17 Main Street
Assessed: \$83,700.00
Requested: \$74,000.00 |
|----|---|--|

This is a vacant building that was purchased for \$74,000.00. Mr. Swann stated that the roof leaks; there is no plumbing or heat. The higher taxes will create a financial burden for him while trying to finish working on the building.

Gary Hults made a motion to uphold the Assessor based on the lack of evidence. Seconded by Lisa Wasson and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|---|--|
| 4) | Robert and Arlene Gall
68 Blue Pond Manor
Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 198.07-1-21
Property Address: 67 Blue Pond Manor
Assessed: \$63,000.00
Requested: \$20,700.00 |
|----|---|--|

Mr. Gall bought this house in 2012; it is across the street from his current house. He bought it to clean up the land, and may tear down the house. The power and water have all been turned off; the house needs to be completely re-done, and would need all new windows, new electric and a new furnace.

Mr. Gall brought in pictures of a comparable house on Blue Pond. Gary Hults made a motion to lower the assessment to \$45,000.00 based on the evidence, seconded by Lisa Wasson and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|--|--|
| 5) | Paul Fisher
80 Belcoda
Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 198.01-1-18.3
Property Address: 80 Belcoda
Assessed: \$301,800.00
Requested: \$254,900.00 |
|----|--|--|

Nothnagle appraised Mr. Fisher's house for 254,900.00 in 2008. The Assessor stated that the new Office was not included in that appraisal. He also stated that the cost listed on the building permit was \$290,000.00 when the house was built, and that figure does not take into account the 8 acres. Mr. Fisher brought in a list of houses to use for comparisons.

Lisa Wasson decided to uphold the Assessor's decision after looking at the list of comparable houses, seconded by Gary Hults and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|--|---|
| 6) | David Gray
200 Monteroy Road
Rochester, NY 14618 | Tax Account No. 199.02-1-11
Property Address: Scottsville-Mumford Road North
Assessed: \$18,400.00
Requested: \$5,000.00 |
|----|--|---|

Mr. Gray brought in an appraisal from Nothnagle done in 1992, stating that the land is mostly woods and wetlands and unsuitable for farming. They also stated the fact that the land is landlocked, therefore making it nearly impossible to sell except to someone with adjacent property.

Lisa Wasson stated that due to the fact that the land is wetlands and landlocked, it would be worth around \$800.00 an acre. She made a motion to lower the assessment to \$9,300.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|--|---|
| 7) | Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468 | Tax Account No. 187.03-1-1
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$5000.00
Requested: \$2,500.00 |
|----|--|---|

Robert Russo came to speak on his brother's behalf. They have 14 parcels of vacant land that Mr. Russo stated is mostly Federal and New York State Wetlands. The land is mostly landlocked and there is a creek and electric lines running through the properties. He stated that it cannot be developed in most areas.

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$2,500.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

- | | |
|--|--|
| Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468 | Tax Account No. 187.03-1-2
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,800.00
Requested: \$2,400.00 |
|--|--|

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$2,400.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-3
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,800.00
Requested: \$2,400.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$2,400.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-4
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,800.00
Requested: \$2,400.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$2,400.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-5
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,600.00
Requested: \$2,300.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$2,300.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-6
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,400.00
Requested: \$1,760.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,760.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-7
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,400.00
Requested: \$1,760.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,760.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-8
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,400.00
Requested: \$1,760.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,760.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-9
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,200.00
Requested: \$1,680.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,680.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-10
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,200.00
Requested: \$1,680.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,680.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-11
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,200.00
Requested: \$1,680.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,680.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-12
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$4,200.00
Requested: \$1,680.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$1,680.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 187.03-1-77
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$7,700.00
Requested: \$3,560.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$3,560.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

Norael Group
Michael Russo
5 Quail Run
Hilton, NY 14468

Tax Account No. 186.04-1-6.1
Property Address: Fairview Road
Assessed: \$52,500.00
Requested: \$27,440.00

It was determined by the board that this land can only be used for recreational purposes, and cannot be developed due to the wetlands. W. Smith O'Brien made a motion for the assessment to be lowered to \$27,440.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|---|--|
| 8) | Brenda Lester
13 Cedar Street
Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 187.14-1-58
Property Address: 13 Cedar Street
Assessed: \$103,100.00
Requested: \$88,000.00 |
|----|---|--|

Ms. Lester purchased the house in 2011 for \$88,000.00. The house had set vacant for over a year, and has not been updated. The only improvements that she has made since purchasing the home has been to pull out carpets and clean. She stated that the comparisons that were used were all more updated than her house and more square footage.

Gary Hults made a motion to uphold the Assessor based on lack of evidence, seconded by W. Smith O'Brien, and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|----|---|---|
| 9) | Robert Reed
98 Smith Street
P.O. Box 82
Mumford, NY 14511-0082 | Tax Account No. 208.15-1-53
Property Address: 98 Smith Street
Assessed: \$58,500.00
Requested: \$45,000.00 |
|----|---|---|

Mr. Reed brought in a list of comparable houses and graphs. He was not sure why his house's assessment increased by 30% when he has made no updates in the last two years. He also stated that none of the houses around him have had their assessment increase.

Lisa Wasson made a motion to reduce the assessment to \$45,000.00 based on the submitted evidence, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

- | | | |
|-----|--|---|
| 10) | James Zielinski
1810 Flint Hill Road
Leroy, NY 14482 | Tax Account No. 207.02-1-3
Property Address: 1810 Flint Hill Road
Assessed: \$174,200.00
Requested: \$154,200.00 |
|-----|--|---|

Mr. Zielinski stated that this land is a super fund site. The ground water was contaminated when a tank car ruptured one and a half mile away from his house. There have only been four new houses built since he built his in 1978. The ground is solid rock 32" below the soil, making

farming the land impossible. He also stated that he has a cliff and an old railroad bed on the land. He also has very high levels of radon in his basement. The house was appraised in 2000 for \$140,000.00.

Lisa Wasson made a motion to lower the assessment to \$162,800.00, seconded by Gary Hults, and unanimously passed.

11)	Scott Krenzer	Tax Account No. 186.04-1-1.1
	1001 Chili-Scottsville Rd	Property Address: Chili-Scottsville Road
	Scottsville, NY 14546	Assessed: \$128,800.00
		Requested: \$82,800.00

Mr. Krenzer stated that his land is split between the Town of Chili and the Town of Scottsville. He lives on the land in Chili; the land in Scottsville is vacant farm land. He stated that Chili and Scottsville use different rates for assessing farm land. His land in Chili is assessed at \$1,800.00/acre, where Scottsville is \$2,800.00/acre. Mr. Krenzer stated that it is the same soil, on both sides of the dividing line.

The board thought that the assessed value per acre should be the same across town lines. Gary Hults made the motion to lower the assessment to \$2,200.00/acre, resulting in an assessment of \$101,200.00. Seconded by Lisa Wasson, and unanimously passed.

12)	Karen Coyle	Tax Account No. 208.01-1-14
	1763 Beulah Road	Property Address: 3464 Oatka Trail Rd
	Churchville, NY 14428	Assessed: \$404,700.00
		Requested: \$304,700.00

Mrs. Coyle was looking for her assessment to be reduced \$50,000.00 for the land and \$50,000.00 for the improvements, which are the house and the barns, she stated that a large portion of their land is located across the creek and can only be accessed by a small tractor. She also stated that the barns are crumbling and the house is in very bad shape also.

W. Smith O'Brien made a motion to uphold the Assessor based on the lack of evidence presented. This was seconded by Lisa Wasson, and unanimously passed.

The following grievance was received through the mail by the Assessor prior to the meeting.

13)	Martin and Michael Welsch	Tax Account No. 200.38-1-8
	201 Scottsville W. Henrietta Rd	Property Address: 2 Main Street
	W. Henrietta, NY 14586	Assessed: \$92,400.00
		Requested: \$63,000.00

Mr. Welsch bought this property in 2002 for \$49,500.00 to use as income to help supplement his retirement. He stated that is has operated at a loss from the start. Mr. Welsch stated that he would like the value to be set based on the historical profit record as a commercial property, rather than its hypothetical market value.

Gary Hults made a motion to uphold the Assessor's decision based on the lack of evidence provided, seconded by Lisa Wasson, and unanimously passed.

There being no further grievances, the meeting adjourned at 9:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Renee Smith
Recording Secretary